

PLANNING APPLICATION REPORT

Case Officer: Bryony Hanlon

Parish: Newton and Noss **Ward:** Newton and Yealmpton

Application No: 1332/22/HHO

Agent:

Mr Derek Butler
Derek Butler Designs Ltd
Hexhill Cottage
Brixton Torr
Plymouth
PL8 2BD

Applicant:

Mrs C Story
Netton Farmhouse
Netton
Noss Mayo
Plymouth
PL8 1HB

Site Address: Netton Farmhouse, Noss Mayo, PL8 1HB



Development: Householder application for single storey side extension to kitchen.

Reason for call-in: Cllr Thomas has called this in as he wishes to debate the application of Neighbourhood Plan policies N3P-1(c), N3P-4(ai, iii), N3P-8(b) and N3P-3(a, b).

Recommendation: Refusal

Reasons for refusal:

The proposal appears incongruous against the robust and traditional form of the host dwelling which would be harmful to the character and appearance of a Non-Designated Heritage Asset, thus failing to conserve and enhance the landscape and scenic beauty of this part of the South Devon AONB, contrary to the provisions of TTV29(5), DEV20(2,3,4), DEV21(3), DEV23(1,2,3), DEV24(3,5), DEV25(2,3,8), Newton and Noss Neighbourhood Plan policies N3P-1(c), N3P-4(ai, iii), N3P-8(b), N3P-3(a, b), the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs, 6.75-6.79, 13.6-7, 13.11 and 13.15 of the Plymouth and South West Devon Supplementary Planning Document 2020 and the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs 130, 134, 176, 178 and 203 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Key issues for consideration:

Design, scale and massing, impact on a Non-Designated Heritage Asset, impact on the South Devon Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, the Heritage Coast and the Undeveloped Coast.

Site Description:

The site is located within the countryside, within the hamlet of Netton, c. 1.2km south east of the village of Noss Mayo. The site hosts a large detached dwelling of traditional proportions and materials. The dwelling has been altered and extended during its lifetime but retains much of its original character and is one of the larger dwellings in the hamlet. The dwelling benefits from off-road parking and turning to the west and north of the dwelling, with the main private amenity space to the south.

The site is located within the South Devon Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, the Heritage Coast and the Undeveloped Coast.

The Proposal:

The applicant wishes to construct a single storey extension on the north elevation of the dwelling. The extension is designed with a pitched roof and glazed gable, with main access door on the north elevation. The canopy over the existing front door will be extended in order to tie in with the new extension. The extension will be finished in natural stone, painted timber glazing and a natural slate roof.

Consultations:

- County Highways Authority No comments received
- Parish Council Support

Representations:

None received.

Relevant Planning History

Planning Application Reference	Description	Site Address	Decision
2350/16/HHO	Householder application for erection of an oak framed garden room.	Netton Farmhouse, Netton Farm, Noss Mayo, PL8 1HB	Conditional approval: 30 Sep 16

ANALYSIS

Principle of Development/Sustainability

The site is located within the hamlet of Netton and hosts a single residential dwelling; the principle of extending dwellings within this context is therefore established, subject to compliance with the other protective designations in this highly sensitive location.

The applicant was advised during the life of the application that the proposal could not be supported, although it is noted that the Parish have supported the scheme. Alternative designs were discussed but it was not possible to reach a mutually acceptable compromise and the application has been determined on the basis of the plans as advertised.

Design, Heritage and Landscape

A farmstead at Netton is mentioned in the Domesday Book (HER MDV19395¹), with the existing Farmhouse first noted on the First Edition Ordnance Survey map dated 1880-1899. Due to the building's age and the fact that much of the original fabric and character of the building remain, Officers consider the building a Non-Designated Heritage Asset in accordance with policy DEV21 and the guidance contained within paragraphs 6.75-6.79 of the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan Supplementary Planning Document 2020. It is noted that such consideration does not preclude development but rather that "appropriate weight must be given to the asset in consideration of planning balance" (paragraph 6.78).

The host dwelling is a large two storey stone dwelling, of traditional form and proportions, set under a slate roof. The site occupies a corner plot and as such, both the north and west elevations are visible from within the public realm. The proposed development would introduce a new single storey, pitched roof element on the north elevation, with a new arrangement of fenestration, including apex glazing in the north elevation. As such, the proposal fails to "have proper regard to the pattern of local development in terms of style, local distinctiveness, layout, orientation, scale, massing, materials, detailing, historic value and character" as required by policy DEV20 (2) and paragraphs 13.6-7, 13.11 and 13.15 of the SPD. The host dwelling is partly characterised by its high solid to void ratio and the introduction of large areas of glazing would contrast starkly with the design theme of the host dwelling, thus failing to deliver "high quality architectural design appropriate to its landscape context" contrary to DEV23(3).

The proposal appears incongruous against the robust and traditional form of the host dwelling which would be harmful to the character and appearance of a Non-Designated Heritage Asset, thus failing to conserve and enhance the landscape and scenic beauty of this part of the South Devon AONB, contrary to the provisions of TTV29(5), DEV20(2,3,4), DEV21(3), DEV23(1,2,3), DEV24(3,5), DEV25(2,3,8), Newton and Noss Neighbourhood Plan policies N3P-1(c), N3P-4(ai, iii), N3P-8(b), N3P-3(a, b), the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs, 6.75-6.79, 13.6-7, 13.11 and 13.15 of the Plymouth and South West Devon Supplementary Planning Document 2020 and the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs 130, 134, 176, 178 and 203 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Neighbour Amenity

Due to the scale, nature and siting of the proposal relative to near neighbours, it is not considered that the proposal would give rise to a detrimental impact on amenity for surrounding residents. As such, the proposal is considered to accord with the provisions of DEV1 and this does not form a substantive reason for refusal.

Biodiversity

The applicant has provided a Preliminary Ecological Appraisal to confirm that there are no ecological constraints to development on the site. The Appraisal contains a number of precautionary recommendations in order to safeguard the interests of protected species, which would be

¹ https://www.heritagegateway.org.uk/Gateway/Results_Single.aspx?uid=MDV19395&resourceID=104

appropriate to secure through condition, were the development considered otherwise acceptable. On this basis, the proposal is considered to accord with the provisions of DEV26 and this does not form a substantive reason for refusal.

Highways/Access

The scheme does not include any alterations to the existing access or parking arrangements. As such, it is not considered that the proposal will result in an increased risk to highways safety and the proposal accord with the provisions of DEV29.

Construction Management Plan

The Neighbourhood Plan (policy N3P - 4: Development and Construction) requires that the applicant “provide[s] safeguards during construction to protect against environmental damage or local nuisance particularly from deliveries and parking. Specific proposals are to be submitted with the application to demonstrate how this requirement will be met”. The applicant has submitted a Construction Management Plan to comply with this requirement. In the context of the scale of the proposal, this Plan is considered broadly acceptable, although some minor revisions would be required to prevent any works or deliveries being undertaken outside working hours or on Sundays or Bank Holidays under any circumstance and that no road blockages would be caused at any time. Were the development otherwise acceptable it would be considered appropriate to secure the revised details by condition in the interests of residential amenity and highway safety in accordance with policy N3P-4c of the Newton and Noss Neighbourhood Plan. On this basis, the proposal is considered to accord with the provisions of N3P-4c and this does not form a substantive reason for refusal.

Conclusion

The proposal appears incongruous against the robust and traditional form of the host dwelling which would be harmful to the character and appearance of a Non-Designated Heritage Asset, thus failing to conserve and enhance the landscape and scenic beauty of this part of the South Devon AONB, contrary to the provisions of TTV29(5), DEV20(2,3,4), DEV21(3), DEV23(1,2,3), DEV24(3,5), DEV25(2,3,8), Newton and Noss Neighbourhood Plan policies N3P-1(c), N3P-4(ai, iii), N3P-8(b), N3P-3(a, b), the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs, 6.75-6.79, 13.6-7, 13.11 and 13.15 of the Plymouth and South West Devon Supplementary Planning Document 2020 and the guidance contained within but not limited to paragraphs 130, 134, 176, 178 and 203 of the National Planning Policy Framework. On this basis, the application is recommended for refusal.

This application has been considered in accordance with Section 38 of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

Planning Policy

Relevant policy framework

Section 70 of the 1990 Town and Country Planning Act requires that regard be had to the development plan, any local finance and any other material considerations. Section 38(6) of the 2004 Planning and Compensation Act requires that applications are to be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. For the purposes of decision making, as of 26 March 2019, the Plymouth & South West Devon Joint Local Plan 2014 - 2034 is now part of the development plan for Plymouth City Council, South Hams District Council and West Devon Borough Council (other than parts of South Hams and West Devon within Dartmoor National Park).

The relevant development plan policies are set out below:

The Plymouth & South West Devon Joint Local Plan was adopted by South Hams District Council on 21 March 2019 and West Devon Borough Council on 26 March 2019.

SPT1 Delivering sustainable development

SPT2 Sustainable linked neighbourhoods and sustainable rural communities

SPT9 Strategic principles for transport planning and strategy

SPT10 Balanced transport strategy for growth and healthy and sustainable communities
SPT11 Strategic approach to the Historic environment
SPT12 Strategic approach to the natural environment
TTV1 Prioritising growth through a hierarchy of sustainable settlements
TTV2 Delivering sustainable development in the Thriving Towns and Villages Policy Area
TTV26 Development in the Countryside
TTV29 Residential extensions and replacement dwellings in the countryside
DEV1 Protecting health and amenity
DEV2 Air, water, soil, noise, land and light
DEV20 Place shaping and the quality of the built environment
DEV21 Development affecting the historic environment
DEV23 Landscape character
DEV24 Undeveloped coast and Heritage Coast
DEV25 Nationally protected landscapes
DEV26 Protecting and enhancing biodiversity and geological conservation
DEV28 Trees, woodlands and hedgerows
DEV29 Specific provisions relating to transport
DEV31 Waste management
DEV32 Delivering low carbon development
DEV35 Managing flood risk and Water Quality Impacts

Neighbourhood Plan

Following a successful referendum, the Newton & Noss Neighbourhood Plan was made at Executive Committee on 19 July 2018. It now forms part of the Development Plan for South Hams District and is used when determining planning applications within the Newton & Noss Neighbourhood Area.

The relevant policies are noted below;

N3P - 1: The Village Settlement Boundaries
N3P - 2: Protecting the Waterfront
N3P - 3: Development Policy Areas
N3P - 4: Development and Construction
N3P - 5: Movement and Parking
N3P - 6: Drainage and Flooding
N3P - 8: Heritage and Conservation
N3P - 9: Protecting the Landscape

Other material considerations include the policies of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and guidance within the Planning Practice Guidance (PPG). Additionally, the following planning documents are also material considerations in the determination of the application: South Devon AONB Management Plan (2019-2024), Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan Supplementary Planning Document 2020, Historic England Advice Note 7 (2nd edition) 2021.

Considerations under Human Rights Act 1998 and Equalities Act 2010

The provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998 and Equalities Act 2010 have been taken into account in reaching the recommendation contained in this report.